

Minutes of Meeting	Technical Assistance to Preparation of Drinking Water Projects in 8 Municipalities in Turkey
Heading	Public Consultation Meeting Regarding the Potential Environmental Impacts of Er- zincan Municipality Wastewater Disposal Improve- ment Project
Date	May 22, 2009, 10.00
Location	Erzincan Municipality
Attendants	Yüksel ÇAKIR (Mayor of Erzincan Municipality), Adnan GÜLER (Deputy Mayor of Erzincan Muni- cipality), Yunus KOÇYİĞİT (Erzincan Police Director- ate, Director), Erdiñ KÜÇÜKKAYA (Civil Engi- neer), Fatih ÇAĞLAR (Chamber of Commerce), Said SAYGÜN (Çayırlı district council member), Erzincan Public Health Personnel, Halime KELEŞ (Member of Council), Gürbüz OKTAY (Erzincan Municipality - Head of Water and Sewerage Department), Fidem Primary School Students,
Water Consortium	- Press, Erzincan Public, (approximately 120 individuals in total) Nahit Ozan Tunçkılıç (DEGOL)
Prepared By	K. Banu GÖLE (DEGOL)
Distribution	Water Consortium, Erzincan Municipality

Public Consultation Meeting Regarding the Potential Environmental Impacts of Erzincan Municipality Wastewater Disposal Improvement Project

1 Introduction

Public Consultation Meeting Regarding the Potential Environmental Impacts of Erzincan Municipality Wastewater Disposal Improvement Project had been realized on May 22, 2009 in the meeting hall of Erzincan Municipality with the participation of approximately 120 persons.

Following the opening speech of Mr. Adnan Güler, Deputy Mayor of Erzincan, Mr. Ozan TUNÇKILIÇ made a presentation regarding the project.



2 Presentation Regarding the Environmental Impacts of the Project

DEGOL Executive N. Ozan TUNÇKILIÇ made a presentation about the general features and environmental measures to be taken for public consultation purposes. (One copy of this presentation had been attached to the minutes of public consultation meeting).

3 Questions and Answers

After the completion of the presentations, the attendants asked the following questions:

Q 1. Yunus KOÇYIĞİT: Will this study incur a cost and expense to institutions and houses?

A 1. Adnan GÜLER: As a result of this study, there is not any price that shall be reflected to the institutions or customers, our projects does not include an additional fee except the contribution charges that shall be collected by the Ministry of Environment and Forestry under the new harmonization laws that shall be enforced in terms of compliance with European Union environmental acquis.

Q 2. Cansu: -Fidem Primary School Student: How do you consider not to give harm to the environment while executing this project?

A 2. Adnan GÜLER: FOPIR, Master Plan, Feasibility Studies related to the project were carried out in accordance with EU standards. Erzincan Municipality, together with Water Consortium, Ministry of Environment, İller bank, State Hydraulic Works, Delegation of the European Commission to Turkey, Central Finance and Contracts Unit and other organizations that take part in the project, have broadly evaluated how to implement modern technology in these projects. We endeavor to perform this work by using the latest technologies of the developed countries. Above all, of course, we will temporarily give harm to the environment, excavations and drillings will be carried out but all of these shall be temporary, they shall not give any permanent damage to the ecosystem. All damages to the environment and noise pollution shall be at the lowest limits. However, above all, we do not want to give any harm to the environment in solid waste systems and while treating wastewater because their harms to the environment are permanent and have long-lasting impacts. Therefore, our treatment systems shall have a structure ensuring a modern and efficient treatment of the wastewater.

The treated wastewater will be conveyed to Karasu river in compliance with EU and Turkish standards to avoid pollution of the river.

Q.3 Ece:-Fidem Primary School Student: I would like to add something to the question of my friend regarding Cansuyu, how will you benefit from the tech-

nology in order to give minimum damage to the environment?

A 3. Ozan TUNÇKILIÇ: I am an Environmental Engineer, I had prepared the Environmental Impact Assessment Report of Erzincan Municipality. In this scope, we, the environmental engineers, collect all the related information and make evaluations while preparing our reports before a project is implemented. For each unit, there is a calculation of every item from noise, to dust and from waste oil to solid waste and amount of water to be used, as a result of these calculations there is a measure to take for decreasing the amount of produced waste. In the report we determined such measures.

We write down all of these measures one by one, but here I can give a few examples to them; an excavation will be made, pipes will be laid, you cannot completely avoid dust formation during their laying however you may minimize this especially by spray sprinkling in the excavation area, in addition to this, trucks will take the soil from the excavation area and transport it to another place and store there, during such storage if the road which the trucks will pass by is an earth road, it always leads to dust formation. Covering of trucks and sprinkling of roads will be used, if required, to reduce dust formation. However, it is not possible to eliminate dust formation completely but we will minimize it.

Namely, we will try to minimize it by taking all measures either related with waste oil, noise, water, as you may see, I am not saying that we will cause bad events, dust and noise, of course they shall occur, their occurrence is unavoidable however we shall minimize them. As Mr. Adnan expressed just now, all of these measures is a common system used all over the world.

Adnan GÜLER: I thank to Mr. Ozan and furthermore I would like to add that especially for the ones who are interested, project introduction file and all related information is available in our web site. All files are in pdf format, you can either have a look at them or download them. We will also give a leaflet to your class as a gift.

Q 4. Salih KARA: How do you plan to prevent leakages from solid wastes while collecting waste solids? Will the wastewater project only be within Erzincan central province borders? Alternatively, do you think of including districts in it? Do you consider collecting solid wastes from our districts and villages and evaluating them under the project? When we think that a plastic bottle remains for three thousand years in the nature, how do you think to evaluate plastic bottles? What are your considerations regarding the recycling of medical solid wastes?

A 4. Adnan GÜLER: I thank to Mr. Salih, you asked not only one but many questions, if we will try to answer all of these questions, we would not have enough time for it.

As I mentioned in my speech before, we had established Local Administrations department in the leadership of Erzincan Municipality by integrating Erzincan Governorate together with all municipalities of sub-provinces and districts. As you know, one of the basic purposes in establishing such association is to establish a waste management department in the province, I hope that these studies - the ones which you carry out the secretariat thereof- are continuing and will continue.

Regarding wastewater, I can say that the municipalities in our proximity, Demirkent and Geçit are connected to our system, Kavakyolu, Çukurkuyu, Yalnızbağ and Ulalar districts will be connected to the system.

Another project financed by Ministry of Environment is ongoing, work of common line construction will begin in near future, planning is required, of course all wastewater shall be conveyed to our treatment plant. Appropriate ones shall be arranged and evaluated within this frame.

I do not want to talk about solid waste, because it is out of subject, as I said before, subject is not clarified yet, when they will be clarified our Mayor shall give a detailed information both to you and to public and these explanations shall be on the solution point, I hope we shall take an remarkable step in this subject.

Medical wastes shall be included in the other project mentioned, our works regarding medical waste disposal and our works regarding all wastes are ongoing and all of them are being carried out according to European Union acquis in world standards, our aim is to reach world standards, we introduced our project to Ministry of Environment. They commented as "this project is a one that can constitute a model in Turkey". Directorate General of Environmental Management stated that they will provide a significant support to us regarding the project. I can only state these for now.

Q 5. Erdiñ KÜÇÜKKAYA: I am a civil engineer I heard that capacity of Kurutilek wells shall be increased until 2040, why do not we provide drinking water from spring water? Did you carry out any studies regarding spring waters? Why do we use deep wells? Its production costs more.

Erzincan Public Health Personnel: Water abstracted from Kurutilek for Erzincan Municipality is a spring well as well as water abstracted from Beytahtı.

A 5. Adnan GÜLER: Of course these spring waters seem to be rich in the region, however we monitored Çarhenek water for 4-5 years, we planned to supply water from here but it was not possible to take it without any treatment. Therefore, treatment of drinking water is an expensive process and there are some boredoms regarding sustainability, there had been boredoms in terms of quality, in summers it is used for irrigation for 5-6 months and its flow decreases, but in summers our water demand increases and we need more water.

All of these options were evaluated. In the results of the evaluations, waters we supply both from Kurutilek and Beytahtı sources are in the standards acceptable by European Union and without any problems in terms of their economical sustainability and they found to be potable in the results of the analyses carried out in the accredited laboratories.

Anyway, our sensitivity in this meeting is that we should be able to use these underground waters for a long time without polluting them. We should unconditionally succeed. Our sensitivity on environmental issues also covers this, thanks.

Q 6. Fatih ÇAĞLAR: It is said that the network will be renewed under Cansuyu project and water tariffs will be reduced, is it true?

A 6. Adnan GÜLER: Of course, the network shall be completely renewed till the water meter of the consumer (the meters were also included however there was no legal basis, prepaid meters were removed from the project.) These are true.

It is not true that the water bills will be reduced, why not? The feasibility study under the project points out the importance of maintaining the current price system or even applying an increase of Eurocent 4 so that the Water Utility Department is able to provide the same service to the population in future in a sustainable manner. In many places in Turkey, water is more expensive than our potable water even they are problematic in terms of human consumption. Whereas the experts and analyses indicate that our water does not have any problem and we can correct this information accordingly, Mr Çağlar,

Q 7. Fatih ÇAĞLAR: I would like to say that we have a lot of water leakages, they are more than the amount we consume, why do not you decrease the water tariffs when these leakages will be avoided?

Yüksel ÇAKIR: Both for information and in order to explain the problem better, how much is our water demand when we take the number of domiciles and citizens living in the province as basis? What is the amount of water pumped from the pumps? In other words, when you compare the amount of water entering into the system and water flowing from the taps, everybody can understand it.

A 7. Gürbüz OKTAY: When we consider on the basis of houses, our accrued water amount is approximately 6,000,000 m³, while the amount of produced water is over 10,000,000 m³, according to a study carried out by European Union, a loss of 40% is in question during consumption, but not all of this amount is loss. There are some sections without meters, this is mentioned in the section explained according to the council decisions.

However we do not reflect this deficit to the citizens, we have a power cost of approximately 1 trillion, in case we will attempt to reflect it only in our pumping stations we have to exceed the base so much, I mean we can sell the water not from 1 million perhaps 2 million. But what will happen when we replace the network, there is no chance for a loss level at zero, it is not possible anywhere in Turkey and also in Europe, but to what extent we can decrease it if we do? In case we will decrease it to 15% to the Turkish standards, it means a decrease of 25%, therefore reflections in the future may not return to consumers but there will not be an increase, that's the case.

Yüksel ÇAKIR (Mayor of Erzincan Municipality): We can consider about making it a sustainable system, we are endeavor and spend our efforts to supply water to Erzincan without incurring additional cost related with the sustainability of the system, we can say that this is one of the reasons for renewal.

Here we can say that this is a study related with decreasing costs by controlling the losses and leakages, there is not a problem regarding water quality.

As it was mentioned, there is a difference of almost 50% between demand and water pumped, this is a great rate and when we will be able to control it, its cost will also decrease.

Q 7. Said SAYGÜN: Will this project be implemented in the sub-provinces? Can this project be implemented in the sub-provinces of Erzincan? I thank you

A 7. Adnan GÜLER: I thank to Mr. Said, the project on which we talk about is only a project covering Erzincan Municipality and Erzincan provincial territory.

Q 8. Halime KELEŞ: When there is an epidemic disease in question, people in health sector always warns us not to drink tap water, this makes me annoyed, why are not we informed better? Why do doctors immediately make a warning not to drink tap water, let's explain it to the doctors.

A 8. Adnan GÜLER: I thank Mrs. Halime, I will make an explanation later but among us there is a health care professional and I think it would be better if he will inform us.

There is not any problem regarding our water, this is a water that was examined by biological and other radioactive analyses both in accredited laboratories in Turkey and the accredited laboratories abroad, therefore there is not any problem with water of Erzincan, however whenever a diarrhea case occurs, " do not use water without boiling" is a general rule. This is a rule in preventive medicine. Here there are some health care professionals among us and they can provide detailed information.

Erzincan Public Health Personnel: We continuously monitor for 5 years, water coming from our taps is 100% safe.

Halime KELEŞ: Bad promotion is made regarding Erzincan water.

Q.9 Göktuğ:-Fidem Primary School Student: Do you think that you will encounter difficulties during project stage? I did not exactly understand what your profession and task is.

A 9. Adnan GÜLER: I think we could not introduce us well. I am Adnan GÜLER, Gürbüz OKTAY, Head of Water and Sewerage Department, sitting on my right side and we are the staff of Erzincan Municipality, Mr. Ozan TUNÇKILIÇ is a staff member of Water Consortium, he prepared the environmental section of the project on behalf of us and presented it just now.

Naturally, we will encounter many problems but we will overcome these problems together with hundred thousand people living in this city, because we all decided to solve the extremely important infrastructure problem, water issue that is a vital one and wastewater problem and declared our intention.

One of the most important stages of this project is that its 75% will be financed by European Union grants. On the other hand, 10% of it is financed by grant of Ministry of Environment, 10% by İller Bank, long-term credit given by World Bank.

Namely, we as Erzincan Municipality will contribute to the project with co-financing for 5% within the next 4 years, it's all what I want to say.

Q 10. Nazir AYÇİCEK: Will you collect the wastewater fee that is 50% if this project shall be implemented?

A 10. Adnan GÜLER: As you know, wastewater fee is collected as per the law enforced by Ministry of Environment, the rates were determined in laws, of course we will receive wastewater fee, it would not be appropriate to talk about its rates and I do not really know whether it will decrease or not. However, I do not think that it shall increase much.

Q 11. Tuğba TOPRAK: -Fidem Primary School Student: You said there will not be permanent damages, harms shall not be permanent, what are the permanent damages?

A 11. Ozan TUNÇKILIÇ: We have an existing treatment system, in case we will not renew our existing system, the wastewater discharged to the river will contaminate the river, when it contaminates the river, there will be permanent damages on the river, its ecosystem, surrounding trees and greeneries.

But if we take measures, improve Wastewater Treatment Plant and ensure its disposal and discharge a high quality water to the river, it shall not give a significant harm to the river's ecosystem namely the trees and living being there.

Q 12. Bensu AYDIN: -Fidem Primary School Student Where do the water coming from taps go to?

A 12. Adnan GÜLER: It goes to our sewage system and then to our water treatment system, a pre-treatment is carried out afterwards it goes to biological reactor, there are bacteria in the biological reactor, and they disintegrate harmful elements and transform them. This system works like decomposition of a grass or a lead, it converts bio-hazardous bacteria to another form. Then it is conveyed to sedimentation tanks, we collect them and store in solid waste plant and it can be used as fertilizer. Of course after being passed from assays and if it does not contain hazardous bacteria, this is how system works.

On the other hand, we discharge the effluent treated water to Karasu river, it is harmless, if you go and look you can see that fishes, other living being and even trees and grasses are not suffered.

Thanks.

There are some difficulties we experience, you deserve the quality and best of everything, I appreciate all of you.

These questions will definitely be evaluated, they will be reported, published in our web page, evaluated by the experts and the answers of the questions that we could not give here will be available in that report.

I return thanks to all participants, attendants who direct us by their questions and students of Fidem Primary School who made us think deeply with their meaningful questions.

With all my respect, thanks.